# REPORT

# OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSIONS ON THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME <u>7R09140 - "PHYSICAL MEDICINE</u> <u>AND REHABILITATION"</u> OF ASFENDIYAROV KAZNMU FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR PROGRAMMES OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION (RESIDENCY SPECIALTY) MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION

# period of external expert evaluation: 18.11.-20.11.2020

# 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 18 of 23.10.2020, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of educational programmes of residency specialties of Asfendiyarov KazNMU in the period 18-20.11.2020 in the following composition:



# Chairman of the External Expert Commission

TURGUNOV ERMEK MEYRAMOVICH, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", President of the NGO "Surgical Association of the Karaganda Region", a member of the International Surgery Society, a member of the "Association of Independent Experts of Astana" and the "Union of Independent experts of KSMU "





#### **Foreign expert**

KASHIRSKAYA NATALIA YURIEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Chief Researcher, Laboratory of Genetic Epidemiology, Federal State Budgetary Scientific Institution "Medical Genetic Research Centre named after Academician N.P. Bochkov", Moscow, Russian Federation

#### National academic expert

JUMALINA AKMARAL KANASHEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Pediatric Diseases with Neonatology NJSC "West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"











#### National academic expert

RAMAZANOVA RAYGUL MUKHANBETOVNA, MD, Head of the Hematology Course JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education"

#### National academic expert

ESENGARAYEVA SAULE DAMIROVNA, Ph.D., Head of the Department of Medical Rehabilitation with the Course of Sports Medicine JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education"

#### National academic expert

BEKETOVA BAYAN BEISENGALIEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assistant of the Department of Clinical and radiation oncology NJSC "Semey Medical University"

#### National academic expert

AKHMETOVA ALMIRA KALIKAPASOVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Dermatovenereology and Cosmetology NJSC "Semey Medical University"

#### National academic expert

URAZOVA SALTANAT NURGOZHAEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of General Medical Practice with a course of evidence-based medicine NJSC "Astana Medical University"











#### National academic expert

KALIEVA SHOLPAN SABATAEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Clinical Pharmacology and Evidence-Based Medicine NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"

# National academic expert

ZHANTELIEVA LAZZAT ASANOVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Research Work of JSC "Scientific Centre of Urology named after B.U.Dzharbusynova "

# National academic expert

MADYAROV VALENTIN MANARBEKOVICH.

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Surgery with a course of anaesthesiology and resuscitation, Non-Profit Organization "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

# National academic expert

SADIEVA ZHANAR ZAMANKHANOVNA, anaesthesiologist-resuscitator, head of the postgraduate education department of the South Kazakhstan Medical Academy JSC

#### National academic expert LOVINSKAYA ANNA VLADIMIROVNA,

Senior Lecturer of the Department of Molecular Biology and Genetics, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Senior Researcher of the Research Institute of Biology and Biotechnology Problems of the RSE "Al -Farabi Kazakh National University"











#### **Expert Representative of Practical Health**

ZHOLDASBAYEVA KYRMYZY ZHUMABEKOVNA, Deputy Chief Physician for Childhood PSE on REM "City polyclinic No. 1", Almaty

#### **Expert Representative of Practical Health**

NARTPAEVA ASEL TARASOVNA, acting Deputy Chief Medical Officer PSE on REM "City polyclinic No. 30", Almaty

#### **Expert - resident representative**

BAYASHOV ERDOS NURIDINULY, resident physician for 3 years of training in the specialty "Anaesthesiology and Resuscitation, including children's» JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education".

# **Expert - resident representative**

TARASYUKOV ALEXANDER ANDREEVICH, resident physician for 3 years of training in the specialty "Anaesthesiology and resuscitation, including children's" Non-Profit Organization "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

# **ECAQA Observer**

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director general No. 4 dated February 13, 2017). The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" of Asfendiyarov KazNMU for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of Postgraduate Education Programmes (residency specialties) of ECAQA medical educational institutions, education.

#### 2. General part the final report of the EEC

# 2.1 Presentation of Asfendiyarov KazNMU and the educational residency programme in the specialty7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation"

In 2020, KazNMU turns 90 and in 2018 the university was reorganized into a non-profit jointstock company (hereinafter - NJSC) by the Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 5, 2018 No. 166 and received the status of a research university (resolution of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 12.11.2018).

In accordance with the Strategy of KazNMU for 2019-2023, the basis of KazNMU's activities is the trinity - the integration of academic, scientific and clinical activities in order to provide highquality and modern medical care to the population and training of professional personnel. In this regard, by 2018, the university included 5 republican state enterprises, including: JSC Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, JSC Scientific Center for Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery, JSC Scientific Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine , JSC "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology", JSC "Scientific Center of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov ".

KazNMU is one of the founders of the Academic Demanding League, which aims to improve the quality of education by implementing and promoting the principles of academic honesty. The international information and analytical platform Web of Science in November 2019 awarded KazNMU an independent award "Leader in publication activity in the Web of Science Core Collection over the past 5 years among medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan."

KazNMU cooperates with 102 universities, medical and scientific organizations of the near and far abroad, including with TOP-500 universities, implementing joint scientific, research and educational projects.

KazNMU is a full member of international Associations: International Association for Medical Education in Europe (AMEE), European Association of Dental Education (ADEE), World Federation of Dentists (FDI), European Federation of Dentists (EROFDI), European Association of Universities (EUA), International Association of Universities (IUA), the Association of Higher Schools of Management (GSM Barcelona), the World Federation of Pharmacists, the Association for Distance Education "Siberian Open University", the Association of Schools of Public Health in Europe (ASPHER). In 2015, KazNMU became a member of the Association of European Medical Schools (AMSE) and the Organization of PhD Education in Biomedicine and Health Sciences in the European System (ORPHEUS).

Residency was introduced in accordance with the Law "On Education". The first admission to residency was held in 2008. The first issue of residents was carried out in 2010.

For 2020, residency is being implemented in 44 specialties, including 19 educational programmes being accredited for the first time. 605 residents studied at KazNMU from 2017 to 2020. The University trains residents on the basis of 104 clinics, polyclinics, research institutes, and scientific centers. University clinics are: clinic "Aksai", clinic of internal diseases of KazNMU, professorial clinic of KazNMU, dental clinic.

Thus, KazNMU is an innovation-oriented and socially responsible university, a leader in the Republic of Kazakhstan and Central Asia in multi-level training of competitive healthcare and pharmacy specialists through the implementation of a competence-based model of medical and pharmaceutical education with the wide involvement of domestic and foreign scientists and a constant increase in scientific research. potential.

The main educational, scientific and clinical structural unit of the University, which coordinates training at the second stage of medical education in one or more related specialties, is the Dean's Office of Internship and Residency, renamed from August 3, 2020 to the Faculty of Postgraduate Education. The dean's office unites all the departments related to the specialties included in the internship and residency, as well as those general scientific and fundamental departments that, in terms of the content of their work, are closest to the profile of the second level of higher medical education.

#### 2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Accreditation of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R09140 "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" has not yet been carried out.

# 2.3 Analysis of the report on self-assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09140 "Physical medicine and rehabilitation"

The self-assessment report of the educational programme is presented on 139 pages of the main text, applications on 8 pages and copies or electronic versions of 21 documents on the organization of education, provided in electronic form (located in the cloud on Google Disk (akr.rezidentura@gmail.com).

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as the internal unity of the information provided to the accredited educational programme. The report is accompanied by an accompanying letter signed by the rector prof. T.S. Nurgozhin confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of KazNMU, responsible for the selfassessment of educational programmes, Ph.D. Zhankalova Zulfiya Meirkhanovna, Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education.

Self-assessment of educational residency programmes carried out on the basis of the order on the basis of the order dated 04.08.2020 No. 337 "On approval of the composition of the working group for preparation for accreditation educational programmes of specialties of residency ".

The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report has done a certain amount of work: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffing, educational resources have been analysed, the necessary information has been collected in accordance with Accreditation standards for postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations (hereinafter referred to as accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The database, applications on 8 pages, are presented in full, sequentially and there are links to them in the text of the report. The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

# 2.4 General assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of programmes of postgraduate education (specialty residency) of medical educational institutions.

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report by external experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards and the recommendations of the Self-Assessment Manual, at the same time, based on the results of the expert evaluation, recommendations for adjustments were made, which were taken into

account by the working group.

The report is written consistently in compliance with the logic in the description of the standards, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are numbered consecutively. There are links to regulations, model rules, regulations, educational documents, website pages <u>https://kaznmu.kz/rus/postupajushhim/postdiplomnoe-obrazovanie/rezidentura/</u>

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as the internal unity of the information provided to the accredited educational programme. The report is accompanied by an accompanying letter signed by the rector prof. T.S. Nurgozhin confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of KazNMU, responsible for the selfassessment of educational programmes, Ph.D. Zhankalova Zulfiya Meirkhanovna, Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education.

Self-assessment of educational residency programmes carried out on the basis of the order on the basis of the order dated 04.08.2020 No. 337 "On approval of the composition of the working group for preparation for accreditation educational programmes of specialties of residency ".

The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report has done a certain amount of work: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffing, educational resources have been analysed, the necessary information has been collected in accordance with Accreditation standards for postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations (hereinafter referred to as accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

#### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work on the assessment of the educational programme of residency 7R09140 -"Physical medicine and rehabilitation" of KazNMU was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare" No. 5 2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on 08.11.2020 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector T.S. Nurgozhin.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with residents, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questionnaires of teachers and residents, review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, the study of 23 educational and methodological documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is in the documentation of the accreditation centre and in the annex to this report.

The KazNMU staff ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

No.	FULL NAME.	Position
1.	Bayldinova Clara Zhenisovna	Vice-rector for academic affairs
2.	Zhankalova Zulfiya Meirkhanovna	Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education

3.	Tashetova Aigul Balabekovna	And about. Director of the Department of		
		Academic Affairs		
4.	Nagasbekova Bayan Serikkanovna	Head of Human Development Department		
		resources		
5.	Kulzhakhanova Samal Sagatovna	Head of the Alumni Career Centre		
6.	Tulepbaeva Gulzhan Sovetovna	Head of Clinical Department		
7.	Tuleyev Bakhyt Izidinovich	And about. director of the university clinic		
8.	Saliev Timur Muydinovich	Head of the B.A. Atchabarova		
9.	Syzdykova Aigul Temirbulatovna	Deputy CFO		
10.	Modovov Nurbol Alimbaevich	Library manager		
11.	Zhanbolatova Gulnara Abzhanovna	Deputy library manager		
12.	Nurmakhanova Zhanna Makhmutovna	Head chair		
13.	Israilova Venera Karypbekovna	Head chair		
14.	Akhmetova Gulsim Zhumagalievna	Head chair		
15.	Rakhimov Kairolla Duisembaevich	Head chair		
16.	Nersesov Alexander Vitalievich	Head chair		
17.	Talkimbaeva Naylya Anuarovna	Head of the simulation centre		
18.	Nurmakhanova Zhanat Makhmutovna	Committee of educational programmes		
19.	Ensegenova Zoya Zharbulatovna	Committee of educational programmes		
20.	Kalieva Meruert	Secretary Academician committee		
21.	Sugraliev Akhmetzhan Begalievich	Associate Professor of the Department of Internal		
		Medicine		
22.	Mominkulov Aydar Ordabekovich	Associate Professor of Pediatric Surgery		
23.	Medeubekov Ulugbek Shalkharovich	Head of the Department of General Surgery		
24.	Israilova Venera Karypbekovna	Head of the Department of Resuscitation		
25.	Habizhanov Askar Bolatovich	Associate Professor at the Department of		
		Dermatovenereology		
26.	Salimbaeva Damilya Nurgazyevna	Associate Professor of the Department of		
		Medical Genetics		
27.	Nadyrov Momunzhan Talgatovich	Head of the Department of Plastic Surgery		
28.	Kalmanova Ayman	Resident		
29.	Ali Sultan	Resident		

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is in the documentation of the accreditation centre and in the annex to this report.

#### The first day of the visit is 11/18/2020.

An interview with the management and key employees of KazNMU made it possible to determine the fulfillment of most of the criteria of accreditation standards 1, 2, 5, 7, 8, 9, namely, to identify approaches in developing the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university, the role and place of postgraduate education in clinical direction in the strategy of the university (plan), mechanisms in determining the appropriate specialty of residency of clinical sites and qualified teachers, guaranteeing the adequacy of educational resources through planning public procurements and concluding agreements with country and international partners (more than 100 contracts). Realizing that the accredited residency programme is relatively new, since the first enrollment of the student took place in 2019-2020, the experts studied the documentation in detail,

The experts found that KazNMU strictly adheres to the requirements of regulatory legal acts and SCES in the implementation of educational programmes, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for academic work, reporting, etc.).

The basis for effective management is the Quality Assurance Policy of KazNMU and the "Policies of the Chairs" developed at the departments of residency, as well as adherence to the Quality Guidelines when documenting the educational process (QMS has been constantly supported and certified since 2012).

Conversation with the Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education Zhankalova Z.M. allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching residents, about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents for different specialties, information security of postgraduate education, as well as identifying problems in the management and development of human resources, since most practicing doctors do not know the teaching methodology ...

Zhankalova Z.M. voiced data on international cooperation of the Department of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation, Sports Medicine with Kyungpook National University Hospital (KNUH) of the Republic of Korea (Chilgok Hospital of Gyeongbuk National University), the Korea Foundation (Secretariat of the Central Asia-Republic of Korea Cooperation Forum). The issue of including elective disciplines in the educational programme based on the learning outcomes of an employee of the department and the 1st resident was taken into account.

## The second day of the visit is 11/19/2020.

This day was devoted to visiting clinical bases for the implementation of residency programmes, including scientific centres and research institutes affiliated with KazNMU (Research Institute of Internal Diseases, Scientific Centre of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, Scientific Centre of Oncology). At clinical sites, experts surveyed the resources of the accredited educational programme, their compliance with residency training courses, accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical health care.

The experts obtained evidence of compliance with accreditation standards 2 and 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report of the educational programme.

On the same day, interviews with teachers, residents and employers (representatives of practical health care) took place. It is necessary to take into account the fact that there was no graduation under the accredited educational programme, therefore it was not possible to interview graduates, however, the experience and authority of KazNMU in training residents (since 2007) shows a high percentage of employment (> 90%) of graduates of other programmes residencies and their demand by medical organisations in all regions of Kazakhstan.

Interviews with teachers, as providers of the residency programme, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, depending on the specific clinical base (access of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work of residents). The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, the availability of certification in teaching methods for teachers.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers.

Residents were interviewed to validate the performance of the self-assessment report data and to obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes. 154 residents attended. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with studying at the university, sufficient time for practical training, supervision of patients and work with medical records, as well as satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this university, since they believe that KazNMU has excellent clinical bases and experience in teaching residents, at the same time, residents would like more independent work with patients, especially prompt assistance and more modern literature and interactive teaching methods when dealing with complex cases. Residents believe

Residents showed their commitment to the organisation of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on organizing training, assessing their skills, consulting support, opportunities to participate in research and development, funding, etc.). The experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents-checklists, results of a questionnaire survey of residents).

Interview with 34 employers for all the educational programmes of residency of KazNMU declared for accreditation were conducted online and included such issues as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the deliberative bodies of KazNMU, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in training residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of graduates of residency, etc.

The declared main clinical base City Hospital No. 4 on the day of the commission was unavailable for visits due to the epidemiological situation in the city. All documentation has been submitted electronically.

A review of the resources of the Department of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation, Sports Medicine showed that the clinical base - the children's rehabilitation centre "ARDI" - corresponds to the goals and objectives of the accredited educational programme in the profile of beds, the number of thematic patients, modern equipment and its availability to all students, and the department staff provide collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, the leadership of the clinical base to achieve the final results of the educational programme. The clinical base has 2 training rooms, despite the fact that most of the time residents spend at the patient's bedside and in rehabilitation rooms. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

At the end of the 2nd day of work, the expert commission visited the simulation centre of the university in order to get acquainted with the resources of the university to ensure the educational process. The equipment of the centre is state-of-the-art, covers many training programmes and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare.

#### The third day of the visit November 20, 2020

The experts examined the documentation Department of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation, Sports Medicine, which confirmed the compliance with accreditation standards (nomenclature of the department's affairs, plan for 5 years, annual plan for 2019-2020 academic year and report for 2019, journal of residents' progress, EMCD, feedback questionnaires with residents, teachers, reports on the results of the questionnaire and the measures taken, the code of ethics, etc., control and measuring instruments), including other documentation (21) at the request of the EEC members.

Then a meeting of the EEC members took place following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC began to design the final report of the EEC.

A meeting of the EEC members took place. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. The experts individually completed the "Quality profile and the criteria for external assessment of the NIC for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for the residency programme 7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation". No comments were made by the EEC members on the accredited EP. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate education sector in general and the department implementing the accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

Chairperson of the EEC prof. Turgunov E.M. a final open vote on recommendations for KazNMU and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council were held. Then the Chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organisation

announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment in the framework of accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties.

**Questioning.** An observer from ECAQA in November 16-18, 2020 conducted an online survey of KazNMU residents and teachers on the resource <u>https://webanketa.com/</u>.

#### **Residents survey results:**

The total number of responding residents - 154... Of the total number of respondents, residents of the specialty "family medicine" prevailed - 40%, further on the list: pulmonology - 12%, clinical pharmacology - 12%, therapy - 11%, pediatric oncology and hematology - 6%, general surgery 4%, pediatric surgery - 3%, medical genetics - 2%, other specialties - 1% each.

Will recommend this university as an educational organization - 69% fully agree, partially - 26%. 71% of the respondents fully agree and 23% partially agree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their learning problems. Fully (64%) and partially (29%) are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms and classrooms of the university. According to 62% (in full) and 26% (in part) office equipment is available for residents in practice bases. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - 73% fully agree, partially - 22%. Fully (72%) and partially (25%) are satisfied with the library fund and resources. 76% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources, and 20% believe that it is partially.

The organization of clinical training for residents in the opinion of 81% fully satisfies them, and 15% partially. Fully (74%) and partially (22%) are satisfied with the teaching methods. There is enough time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.) - 82% fully agree, partly 13%. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills - 78% fully agree, partially 21%. According to 73% of teachers in the classroom, they use active and interactive teaching methods regularly, and according to 23% - rarely.

According to 81% of the respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after the end of classes, but according to 16% - sometimes and 2% - rarely. 81% of respondents are fully satisfied that they are studying at a university, partially 16%, disappointed - 1% of respondents. The university allows you to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty of residency 82% are sure, 7% are not sure, 9% cannot give an answer, 1% would like to believe it, 1% began to doubt it. Fully (76%) and partially (23%) are satisfied with the organization of teaching at KazNMU.

According to 71% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism to improve educational programmes, but 12% believe that it is not necessary to carry out and 14% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive - 74%, satisfactory - 14%, i.e. most.

#### **Results of the survey of teachers of residency programmes:**

The total number of teachers on the list is 40. The total number of respondents is 39, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 18%, up to 10 years - 21%, over 10 years - 62%. 59% are fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process, partially - 33%. At the university, ethics is observed and subordination is fully agreed by 72%, partially - 26%. 67% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace, partially 26%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and development of competence for teachers - 67% fully agree, partially - 26%.

In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 72% fully agree, 23% partially. 59% of respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the personnel department, 28% are partially satisfied. The majority of those surveyed have undergone advanced training for the last 5 years. Only 69% fully agree that they can realize themselves as professionals, and 29% partially. Unfortunately, 33% did not answer the question of whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and national events, and 21% did not address this to the management or the relevant administrative staff of the university. The

majority of respondents (74%) fully agree, and 23% partially agree that residents have free access to patients and clinic resources. In a practical lesson, teachers provide residents primarily with syllables (87%), control and measuring instruments (90%), case studies (72%). The level of prior training of residents upon admission to training programmes is fully satisfied by 28% of respondents, partially - 62%. 58% of respondents do not know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers and 8% of respondents doubt about their existence. Management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers - 28%, sometimes - 28% of respondents. When teaching residents, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often work in small groups (74%), analysis of situational tasks (90%), oral questioning and analysis of a topic (74% and 87%, respectively), also problem-oriented training (62%), solving tests (64%), less often cases are compiled and solved (56%). Completely according to 59%,

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the appendix and, in general, demonstrate the positive aspects of training in residency programmes, at the same time, they identify areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, availability of leadership and administration for teachers and residents, pedagogical competencies and professional development of teachers).

#### Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:

Members of the EEC have carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information received by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the activities of the KazNMU visit programme was analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to make sure of the reliability of the information provided to KazNMU and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme of KazNMU described his best practice in compliance with accreditation standards, during an external expert evaluation by EEC members studied 21 documents, learning resources videos, which made it possible to identify the conformity of the activity educational organizations accreditation standards...

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R09140 - "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of an expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on November 20, 2020.

The programme and schedule of the external expert assessment of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the KazNMU team, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of those responsible for the postgraduate education of KazNMU employees, departments, employees of clinical bases, a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" of KazNMU and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

The staff of the department, implementing the residency programme, as the basis of the mission of the educational programme and goals, accepted the mission of the university and informed interested parties (teachers, employers, residents) about it in order to clearly understand the tasks and strive to meet the needs of practical health care. The structure of the educational programme, where there is a dominance of practical training (75%), the sufficiency of clinical bases and a mentoring system allow strengthening the patient-centered approach in the care and treatment of patients. The university organized training and clinical practice in compliance with safety for all participants in the educational process (safety precautions, use of PPE, instructions before training).

Responsible for the residency programme, the Department of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation, Sports Medicine applies a variety of innovations in the learning process, allowing the development of basic and special competencies of residents, namely, work at the patient's bedside, clinical analyzes, solving situational problems, protecting medical records, training in laboratories.

At the same time, the involvement of residents in the scientific work of the department is insufficient, it is carried out on the initiative of individual residents.

The experts received convincing data that the university is autonomous in making decisions in the development of an educational programme in terms of the elective component, the current and final assessment policy, including the choice of assessment methods (testing, oral questioning, clinical examination), selection and admission of residents (specialty exam), personnel policy in relation to teachers for the accredited educational programme, as well as the distribution of resources (classroom fund of clinical bases according to contracts).

The EMCD defines the final learning outcomes in accordance with the qualification requirements for the residency specialty.

The university has developed a Student Ethics Code with which residents are familiarized and work on the development and improvement of communication skills is carried out systematically and integrated into the work programme.

At the same time, the participation of practical health care in the development of the mission and goals of the educational programme is not sufficiently reflected, the expert evaluation is formalized and feedback from practical health care is not collected when forming the components of choice.

# **Overall, Standard 1 demonstrates compliance.**

#### Strengths:

1. Training of residents in the specialty "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" is carried out on the basis of large, multidisciplinary clinical bases of the city with coverage of the main profiles of diseases for rehabilitation assistance by a staff of clinicians, which contributes to the fulfillment of the mission in the implementation of clinic-oriented learning...

2. The department carries out a strategic partnership with international partners (universities, associations), within the framework of which the training of 1 employee of the department and 1 resident was carried out.

3. A clear vision and strategic planning in postgraduate clinical education and an appropriate management structure.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 17 standards conform: completely - 16, significantly - 1 (IS), partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

#### Standard 1: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) enlarge the catalog of elective disciplines based on the results of academic mobility in universities in South Korea;

2) attract and motivate residents to participate in scientific activities through the creation of scientific circles, participation in scientific conferences for young scientists, publications, etc. .;

3) to provide in educational programmes for training residents of disciplines on management of scientific research and medical statistics, organization of health care in the form of a component of their choice.

#### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES**

Accredited specialty residency programme 7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" is implemented in accordance with the State Compulsory Standards and Model Professional Curricula for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21. <u>No. KR DSM-12/2020</u> Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of residency educational programmes with a focus on learning outcomes) for 2 years and during this period, a lot of work has been done to develop teaching materials, organize a place for training residents, form the composition of departments and identify mentors. A model of residents' competencies has been introduced in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty. The structure, content and duration of the programme are clearly defined. The mechanism for the development and approval of the residency programme is determined and regulated by the CEP.

The materials of the report provide evidence of the direct participation of the staff of the department in the planning, development and management of the educational process...

Demonstrated a student-centered learning approach that encourages, prepares and supports learners to take responsibility for their own learning process.

The fundamental principle of the Bologna reforms in higher education, which implies a shift in emphasis in the educational process from teaching to learning, as an active educational activity of the student, is implemented using credit technology, providing a choice of elective disciplines and, mainly, the selection of appropriate teaching methods and assessment of residents. This is reflected in section 2. 4, which describes in detail the structure of the EP, the content of profile and elective disciplines, their duration, and the sequence of study.

The report outlines the organization of training (section 2.5), with an emphasis on clinical sites. Most of the presented databases have ISO certificates, cover a different profile of diseases for rehabilitation assistance, including for children.

The staff of the departments has the necessary competencies for training, at the same time, the mentors represented by the staff of the clinical bases, despite their professional level, do not fully possess pedagogical techniques, which limits the implementation of a high-quality transfer of professional knowledge and skills. The teachers of the department were trained in pedagogy within the university. The dean's office is trying to monitor this process and, through the School of Pedagogical Skills, train newly hired teachers.

Due to the availability of clinical bases for residents, they spend most of their study time in close contact with patients, medical records, including automated healthcare systems. During interviews with residents, experts made sure that the organization of training and work is patient-centered. Clinical training is carried out in the conditions of accredited multidisciplinary clinics, polyclinics and a highly specialized rehabilitation centre in Almaty. Total accredited educational program10 mentors in 4 clinics, who carry out their activities in accordance with the Regulation on mentors. No precedents of inequality, lack of ethics or other violations of a gender, cultural or religious nature have been established in the process of external assessment.

During the examination of the educational programme, it was established that the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, evidence-based medicine are applied, at the same time, residents are not fully involved in the scientific work of the departments, do not have clearly defined research topics, performance criteria, including clinical trials. KazNMU has an extensive base for carrying out scientific work, the formation of basic skills in research activities, a system of encouraging residents to participate in the preparation of reports, work in scientific circles, publications, etc. (section 2. 2).

Thus, the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" demonstrates the integration between teaching and practical work.

#### Strengths:

**1.** Residents work with real patients to develop professional competence in various clinical settings - in specialized departments of hospitals, in polyclinics, a rehabilitation centre, where there is

a sufficient number of topical patients, including children; to improve skills in anatomy and functional anatomy, a simulation centre (SECTRA human body imaging programme) is used.

2. Professional and experienced teaching staff, ensuring the quality implementation of a clinicoriented educational programme.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 31 standards conform: fully - 30, significantly - 1 (IS), partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

#### Standard 2: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) the choice of electives is limited to 2 disciplines, it is necessary to expand the catalog of profile elective disciplines (PED);

2) to strengthen the scientific activity of residents.

#### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES**

KazNMU has developed and implemented a policy for assessing residents, which includes the principles and methods of assessment, which are reflected in the "Academic Policy of the University" (order No. 195 of 08/28/2019), Regulations on the current monitoring of progress, intermediate and final certification of students of the NJSC KazNMU. Responsibility for the implementation of the policy for assessing the educational achievements of residents is borne by the teaching staff of the departments, heads of departments (modules), the office of the registrar.

The assessment of the educational achievements of residents covers the assessment of key competencies, and the assessment tools themselves are developed by departments / modules - control questions, tasks in test form (MCQ tasks with several options for correct answers), a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations. Information about the point-rating system of assessment is posted on the website <u>www.kaznmu.kz</u>...

As an additional method for assessing residents, the portfolio is used, which the experts got acquainted with at the departments supervising the residency programmes.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the Standard Curriculum, which is an integral part of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2017, 2020. in the specialties of residency. The results of educational achievements of students are entered into an electronic educational journal through the office-registrar system and the AIS "Sirius" programme, which automatically generates examination sheets.

The possibility of an appeal based on the results of the interim and final certification of residents is determined in the "Academic policy for 2019-2020 academic year."

The procedure for planning, organizing, monitoring and analyzing assessment methods in KazNMU ensures the reliability and validity of these methods. The development of new control and measuring tools is carried out by teachers through the study of world experience in assessing knowledge in residency, then it is introduced at the department.

Thus, this standard is generally implemented at the university.

#### Strengths:

1. a well-established sequential, multi-stage system of approval of educational and methodological documentation, which ensures their continuity, reliability and validity;

2. use of electronic system "Sirius", which ensures transparency and speed of accounting of the results of the assessment of residents.

*3.* introduction of a portfolio of residents, which makes it possible to assess the development of a resident's competencies: personal interest, professional competence, communicative, personal qualities, scientific interest.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 11 standards conform: fully - 7/4, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

#### Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) to strengthen the scientific activity of residents

#### **Standard 4: TRAINEES**

Full information on recruiting for residency is posted on the University website. Students are admitted on a competitive basis on the conditions regulated by regulatory legal acts.

The residency programme at KazNMU has been implemented since 2008, in the specialty 7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" - since 2019. Admission to residency is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Approval of the Standard Rules for Admission to Training in Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher and Postgraduate Education" dated October 31, 2018 No. 600, State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan - 2015, 2020. and the Rules for admission to the residency of KazNMU for the current academic year. EP residency implies a clinical orientation of training and in-depth specialized training in the relevant specialty.

The conditions for admitting residents are described in detail in the "Rules for admission to residency" for the corresponding academic year, based on regulatory legal acts.

The formation of the contingent of students of the University's residency is carried out by placing a state educational order for the training of specialists, as well as paying for training at the expense of citizens' own funds and other sources, including targeted transfers of local executive bodies (LEBs).

Citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan and stateless persons can participate in the entrance competition for postgraduate studies based on the results of the GPA for bachelor's degree, internship, FSA, entrance exam and availability of scientific publications. The admission of citizens of other states is carried out on a paid basis or on the basis of the allocation of a state educational order for free postgraduate education on the basis of international treaties. The features of admission to residency in 2020 due to the CVI pandemic are described in detail.

When developing proposals for an admission plan, the University takes into account the learning potential as well as the health needs of the community.

The "Academic Policy of the University" describes the conditions for supporting residents in the event of a professional crisis, academic failure and training, the possibility of transferring to another EP or another university, etc. A programme for the academic mobility of residents of this specialty is also provided and implemented.

#### **Strengths:**

1. KazNMU ensured the transparency of the selection procedure and equality of access to postgraduate education;

2. a resident support programme is in place;

3. the programme of academic mobility is being carried out within the framework of international cooperation.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 30 standards conform: fully - 18/12, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

#### Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) to strengthen the scientific activity of residents.

#### **Standard 5: TRAINERS**

According to the presented materials of the report, the university ensures the compliance of the teaching staff with the qualification requirements, the level and specifics of the educational programme. The personnel potential of the teaching staff corresponds to the strategy and specifics of educational programmes. In the selection procedure for teaching staff that ensures the implementation of the educational programme, important attention is paid to the qualifications of the candidate, sufficient experience in the clinic in the relevant specialty, knowledge of the current state of medicine in the region, in the country, in the world.

One of the priority directions of the university's development is the maintenance of an effective personnel policy aimed at ensuring a high level of personnel potential. In accordance with

the orientation of training to practical health care, the staff of teachers of the Department of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation, Sports Medicine is staffed with doctors of the highest category and / or with an academic master's degree. The head of the department has a candidate of medical sciences degree.

In accordance with the needs to improve the level of teaching at KazNMU, within the framework of the international cooperation programme, 1 teacher of the department underwent an internship in Korea. All employees of the department were trained in pedagogy.

#### Strengths:

1. the staff of the department is focused on practical health care;

2. the programme of international cooperation provides for academic mobility of teachers and residents of the department;

3. employee salaries.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 7 standards conform: completely - 5/2, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

#### Standard 5: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) to strengthen the staff of the department with academic staff;

2) to strengthen the scientific activity of the staff of the department: participation in international and republican forums and conferences, publications, publication of educational and methodological literature, training of scientific personnel from among employees and residents, etc.

#### **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

KazNMU named after S. D. Asfendiyarov has a good infrastructure necessary for the successful implementation of EP residency in the specialty 7R0911400 - "Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation" using qualified personnel, material and technical base (MTB), information resources, resources for clinical training.

From the presented material, we can conclude that the university has a sufficient number of modern tools, equipment, classrooms, laboratories for students of all levels and specialties. MTB is available and in good condition and annually updated. The organization of the educational process is carried out in lecture halls, classrooms, educational and research laboratories, in the library, in the premises of cultural and social spheres, in university clinics and clinical bases. All educational and laboratory rooms are equipped with the necessary modern equipment and supplies.

The Department of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation, Sports Medicine has 4 clinical bases that provide coverage of all profiles of diseases (neurology / neurosurgery, traumatology / orthopedics, cardiology / cardiac surgery) for rehabilitation care, including for children. For the initial training in anatomy and functional anatomy, the IT-programme for human body imaging Sectra is provided in the simulation centre of the university.

According to the materials of the report, the university has adequate information and communication technologies to ensure access of students, teachers and other interested parties to resources.

## Strengths:

*1.* sufficient material and technical base (educational buildings, clinics, a scientific library with a book fund and electronic reading rooms, access to international electronic databases of literature, computer classes, a centre of practical skills, AIS "Sirius") to ensure the quality of education.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 21 standards conform: fully - 10/11, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

#### Standard 6: completed

# Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) to involve the polyclinic in Almaty as clinical bases for the 3rd stage of rehabilitation (in PHC conditions).

#### **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

The quality of basic educational programmes is assessed through their analysis and monitoring of compliance with regulatory legal acts. In Asfendiyarov KazNMU, monitoring and evaluation of the implementation of the educational programme is carried out on the basis of the collective solidarity of all stakeholders and employees of the university.

The university has a multilevel approach to the assessment of EP. These estimates are used both jointly and separately.

In accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III "On Education (from <u>changes and additions</u> *as of 07.07.2020*)", "The rules of competitive filling of vacant positions of the teaching staff and scientific workers of KazNMU", the University operates a system of control over the quality of preparation of educational and methodological documentation, including the content of educational programmes.

To monitor the implementation of the educational programme and as problems arise, including those related to resource provision, the following documents are approved and updated at the University:

- SOP "Formation, discussion of educational programmes (EP)"(Order No. 600 dated 02.08.2018)

- <u>SOP "Organization of methodological work</u>"(Order No. 600 dated 02.08.2018)

- SOP "Formation, discussion, approval of QED" (Order No. 600 dated 02.08.2018)

- SOP "Monitoring the quality of the educational process, the use of active teaching methods and multilingualism in the departments" (order No. 4 dated January 14, 2020)

At the specialized CEP, there is a working group on educational programmes that check the draft EP for the current CEP, after which they agree with the chairperson of the CEP and discuss the EP with stakeholders (employers, professional associations and trainees). Subsequently, the EP is discussed at the academic committee, in the Senate, after which it is approved.

Internal and external mechanisms are used to monitor and evaluate EP at the university. External mechanisms include: examinations of graduates through the National Centre for Independent Examination (NCNE) and a survey of employers. Internal mechanisms include: assessment of students, teaching staff, self-assessment of educational units, faculty, university; internal audit by divisions; internal control of departments; current, interim and final certification of residents, etc.

Thus, the educational programme for residents in the specialty 7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" has been monitored and evaluated at all levels: expert evaluation, the Committee for the educational programme of internship and residency, DAD, Academic Committee, Senate, employers. External and internal assessment of the educational programme was carried out by leading specialists of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of physical medicine and rehabilitation.

# Strengths:

**1.** A multi-level and integrated approach to the development, assessment, monitoring of educational programmes ensures its quality and the ability to make corrections as it is implemented.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 10/5, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 7: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) further improvement after monitoring the first graduates of the residency.

#### **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

From the material provided, it follows that the deployment of a strategy, goals, plans and policies in the field of quality assurance of training of specialists at all levels and departments of the university is carried out by discussing the decisions made at meetings of collegial bodies of different levels, which ensures the transparency of EP management. Heads of structural units communicate the strategy, goals and plans to staff, students and other interested parties. The strategy, policy and quality

objectives are achieved through the development of processes and procedures of the management system, the establishment of performance indicators and criteria, monitoring and improvement of management processes, including the budget.

## Strengths:

1. management ensures the coordinated work of all structures of the university, the hierarchy and sequence of actions, legally formalized in the Strategy, Policy and other regulatory documents of the university;

2. stable financial condition;

3. extensive collaboration with partners in the health care sector;

4. active international cooperation.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 8/7, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

# Standard 8: completed

# Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Improvement of financing mechanisms for all levels of education (academic mobility of residents, participation of residents in international events);

2) Optimization of the management system by further introducing the principles of corporate governance.

# **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

This standard was not considered, since training in residency in the specialty 7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" has been conducted since 2019. The first release is planned for 2021.

Thus, 8 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and carrying out the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

# 5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" KazNMU:

- 1. Increase the catalog of elective disciplines based on the results of academic mobility in universities in South Korea;
- 2. Strengthen the staff of the department with academic teachers;
- 3. Expand the catalog of optional specialized disciplines (PED);
- 4. Strengthen the scientific activities of residents;
- 5. Strengthen the scientific activities of the department staff: participation in international and republican forums and conferences, publications, publication of educational and methodological literature, training of scientific personnel from among employees and residents, etc.;
- 6. Further improvement of the educational programme after monitoring the first graduates of the residency;
- 7. Improvement of financing mechanisms for all levels of education (academic mobility of residents, participation of residents in international events);
- 8. Optimization of the management system by further introducing the principles of corporate governance.

# 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Board

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09140 - "Physical medicine and rehabilitation" for a period of 5 years

Chairman	Turgunov Ermek Meyramovich	
The foreign expert	Kashirskaya Natalia Yurievna	
Academic expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	Floug
Academic expert	Ramazanova Raigul Mukhanbetovna	
Academic expert	Esengaraeva Saule Damirovna	- Chullop
Academic expert	Beketova Bayan Beysengalievna	- icercos
Academic expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna	Ho-
Academic expert	Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhaevna	
Academic expert	Kalieva Sholpan Sabataevna	
Academic expert	Zhantelieva Lyazzat Asanovna	
Academic expert	Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich	
Academic expert	Sadieva Zhanar Zamankhanovna	Alex
Academic expert	Lovinskaya Anna Vladimirovna	tet
Representative of practical health care	Zholdasbaeva Kyrmyzy Zhumabekovna	Le
Representative of practical health care	Nartpayeva Asel Tarasovna	fogreed
The representative of the residents	Bayashov Erdos Nuridinuly	E Guit/
The representative of the residents	Tarasyukov Alexander Andreevich	Hand
The observer ECAQA	Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna	

# Attachment 1.

# Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary) Of educational programme in the specialty of residency 7R09140 - ''Physical medicine and rehabilitation'' of KazNMU

		Assessment			
q	Criteria for evaluation				
Standard					
Sta					
	Number of standards = BS * / SU				
		des		Partially compliant	ch
		Totally coincides	ntly nds	com	Does not match
		ly co	ficar spor	ally	not
		otall	Significantly corresponds	arti	oes
1			-	d	9
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	10/6	0/1		
	17 = 10/7				
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 31 = 22/9	22/8	0/1		
3.	ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES 11 = 7/4	7/4			
4	TRAINEES 30 = 18/12	18/12			
5	TRAINERS $7 = 5/2$	5/2			
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES 21 = 10/11	10/11			
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION 15 = 10/5	10/5			
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	8/7			
	15 = 8/7 Total: $147 = 90/57$	00/55	0/2		
	Total: 147 = 90/57	90/55 0/2 147			
		14/			